

# ***On the diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish***

Martin G. Becker  
University of Cologne

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 1. Ingredients of concessivity

	MAIS (Adversativität)	SI (Konditionalität)	PARCE QUE (Kausalität)	QUOIQUE (Konzessivität)	Gesamt
Okkurrenzen	26934	13833	5014	137	45918
Prozentanteil	58,6%	30,1%	10,9%	0,3%	100%

(Corpus: Le Monde 1997, ILR, Stuttgart)

(1a) "It is NOT the case that Brutus' love for Caesar was a reason for not killing him"

(1b) "Brutus killed Caesar, although he LOVED him" (quoted in König & Siemund, example

(6): 4).

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

(2a) No pareces más alta aunque lleves tacones

(you do not seem taller even though you're wearing heels')

(2b) No pareces más alta porque llevas tacones

(it is not the case that you seem taller because you're wearing heels').

*Table 4: Negated causality*

causal constructions	concessive constructions
(i) $\neg$ (because p, q)	although p, $\neg$ q
(ii) $P \rightarrow Q$ ; p; (presuppositions)	$P \rightarrow Q$ ; p; (presupp.)
(iii) $\neg$ (p & q)	
(iv) $p \& \neg q$ ; (since p is a presupp.)	= $p \& \neg q$

König & Siegmund. 2000. Table 2, p. 13

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 2. Diachronic paths of concessivity

### Genesis of concessivity: 5 types of evolution

#### Adversativity

1. Type: **conflict/rejection** (lexical)

Fr. malgré que, Span. a pesar de que

#### Concessive conditionality

3. Type: **Free relatives with free choice reading**

(‘however much’, ‘whatsoever’)

(Fr. quoique, combien que, It. quantunque)

(Lat. quamquam)

4. Type: **scalar focal adverbs + connector**

(Span. aunque, Ptg. ainda que, mesmo que)

(Fr. même si, Span. incluso si)

#### Concessivity

2. Type: **Volitionality**

(*em boa hora* = Ptg. embora, Ospan. maguer(a) que

(optative formula: μακάριε, cf. It. magari)

(Lat. quamvis)

5. Type: **Cancelled/ineffective causality**

(Span. puesto que, Ptg. posto que, bem que)



# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 3. Concessive constructions in Old Spanish and mood

### 1.) Maguer

(3) „Mulier, quamvis [macare ke siegat] docta [doctinata] et sancta, viros in conbentu [conceillo] docere non presumat”

(‘The woman, even if she is educated and holy, should not presume to teach men in the assembly.’) (Glosas Silenses, siglo X):

### 2.) Aunque

(4) Yo veo bien duelo, aunque me lo callo.

(‘I feel my pain plainly, even if/but I do not mention it’. Translation by Saldanha & Hualde, quoted in *ibid.*: 234) (Corbacho: 126, 1438)

### 3.) Que

(5) Que clamemos merçed, oydos non seremos

(‘Even if we cry for mercy, we will not be heard.’)

(Berceo, *Loores* e. 185, quoted in Rivarola: 44)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 3. Concessive constructions in Old Spanish and mood

### 4.) Comoquier que

(6) Comoquiere (sic !) que era en ál malcostumnado, en saludar a ella era bien acordado" (Berceo, mil e., 102 quoted in Rivarola, 40)

(‘Although he was ill-mannered in other respects, he was well-advised to greet her’)

(7) E como quier que estos iuegos sean departidos de muchas maneras, el acedrex es más noble e de mayor maestria que los otros, ffablamos del primeramiento" (Laced, p.6 quoted in Rivarola, 42)

(‘And although these games are played in many ways, the chess play is more noble and requires greater mastery than the others, and we speak of it in the first place’)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

Table 3. Subordinate clauses with *aunque*

Text and year	Preceding the mainclause				Following the mainclause			
	Ind.	Subj. f	Subj. nf	W/o V	Ind.	Subj. f	Subj. nf	W/o V
<i>GEI.</i> 1270–1280			60% (6/10)		10% (1/10)		30% (3/10)	
<i>Lucanor</i> 1335			70.8% (17/24)				29.1% (7/24)	
<i>Pedro I</i> 1370	12.5% (1/8)		25% (2/8)		25% (2/8)		37.5% (3/8)	
<i>Generaciones.</i> 1450–1455	23.5% (4/17)		23.5% (4/17)		47% (8/17)		5.8% (1/17)	
<i>Enrique IV</i> 1480	27% (30/111)	9.9% (11/111)	7.2% (8/111)	10.8% (12/111)	22.5% (25/111)	1.8% (2/111)	8.1% (9/111)	12.6% (14/111)
<i>Celestina</i> 1499	16.6% (18/108)	8.3% (9/108)	27.7% (30/108)	3.7% (4/108)	21.3% (23/108)	5.5% (6/108)	12% (13/108)	4.6% (5/108)
<i>Diálogo.</i> 1535	36.4% (28/77)		15.6% (12/77)		31.1% (24/77)	3.9% (3/77)	11.7% (9/77)	1.3% (1/77)
<i>Coloquios.</i> 1547–1551	13.7% (16/117)	6% (7/117)	26.5% (31/117)	2.6% (3/117)	30.8% (36/117)		17% (20/117)	3.4% (4/117)
<i>Bernal</i> ca. 1568	31.7% (40/126)	1.6% (2/126)	15% (19/126)	3.2% (4/126)	25.4% (32/126)		15% (19/126)	8% (10/126)
<i>Quijote I</i> 1605	27.4% (74/270)	3.7% (10/270)	12.2% (33/270)	8.5% (23/270)	21.8% (59/270)		21.5% (58/270)	4.8% (13/270)
<i>Hombre</i> 1686	14.4% (16/111)	13.5% (15/111)	37.8% (42/111)	4.5% (5/111)	7.2% (8/111)		15.3% (17/111)	7.2% (8/111)

(Table 3: Hualde & Saldanha: 233)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 4. Concessive constructions in Old French and mood

### 1.) Quoi que/quoique

(8) Il ne m'en chaut, que/quoi que tu dies (FabliauxNR, VIII, 96, 26)  
(‘I do not care, whatever you say’)

-Form: For all imaginable possible alternatives x: ( $\forall x$ ) (if  $p_x$  then q)

(9) (...) et quoique il se soit mesfais, ensi conme il est apparans , par ses oevres, il a tout ce fait par mauvais enort et conseil. (BMF, froisacb, 89.021)  
(‘(...) although he has done wrong through his deeds, as it is obvious, so he has done all this out of bad advice and counsel’)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 2.) Bien que

Subjonctif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 185 (92,5 %)	Présumé	158 (85,4 %)
	Irrealis	17 (9,2 %)
	Assertion	0 (0,0 %)
	Inclassable	10 (5,4 %)
Indicatif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 15 (7,5 %)	Présumé	2 (13,33 %)
	Irrealis	5 (33,33 %)
	Assertion	8 (53,33 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
Total (subj./ind.) : 200 occ.		

Figure 8.2

Fréquence relative et valeur modale des modes verbaux  
dans les propositions en *bien que* sans formes douteuses (16<sup>e</sup> siècle)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 2.) Bien que

Subjonctif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 167 (98,2 %)	Présumé	150 (89,8 %)
	Irrealis	16 (9,6 %)
	Assertion	0 (0,0 %)
	Inclassable	1 (0,6 %)

Indicatif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 3 (1,8 %)	Présumé	0 (0,0 %)
	Irrealis	0 (0,0 %)
	Assertion	3 (100,0 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
<b>Total (subj./ind.) : 170 occ.</b>		

**Figure 8.5**

**Fréquence relative et valeur modale des modes verbaux  
dans les propositions en *bien que* sans formes douteuses (18<sup>e</sup> siècle)**

## Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

### 3.) Encore que

Subjonctif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 8 (72,7 %)	Présumé	1 (12,5 %)
	Irrealis	7 (87,5 %)
	Assertion	0 (0,0 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
Indicatif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 3 (27,3 %)	Présumé	0 (0,0 %)
	Irrealis	0 (0,0 %)
	Assertion	3 (100,0 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
Total (subj./ind.) : 11 occ.		

Figure 9.2

Fréquence relative et valeur modale des modes verbaux dans les propositions en *encore que* sans formes douteuses (15<sup>e</sup> siècle)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 3.) Encore que

Subjonctif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 186 (93,0 %)	Présumé	122 (65,6 %)
	Irrealis	60 (32,3 %)
	Assertion	0 (0,0 %)
	Inclassable	4 (2,1 %)
Indicatif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 14 (7,0 %)	Présumé	2 (14,3 %)
	Irrealis	1 (7,1 %)
	Assertion	11 (78,6 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
Total (subj./ind.) : 200 occ.		

**Figure 9.4**

**Fréquence relative et valeur modale des modes verbaux dans les propositions en *encore que* sans formes douteuses (16<sup>e</sup> siècle)**



# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 3.) Encore que

Subjonctif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 176 (88,0 %)	Présumé	162 (92,04 %)
	Irrealis	12 (6,82 %)
	Assertion	0 (0,0 %)
	Inclassable	2 (1,14 %)
Indicatif	Valeur	Nombre d'occurrences
Total occ. : 24 (12,0 %)	Présumé	0 (0,0 %)
	Irrealis	10 (41,7 %)
	Assertion	14 (58,3 %)
	Inclassable	0 (0,0 %)
<b>Total (subj./ind.) : 200 occ.</b>		

**Figure 9.9**  
Fréquence relative et valeur modale des modes verbaux  
dans les propositions en *encore que* (20<sup>e</sup> siècle)



# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 5.) How to account for the subjunctive mood in concessive clauses ?

### 1.) Subjunctive concessives in presuppositional contexts (in Spanish)

(10) Víctor (Desdoblando el Abrigo) Hay algo confuse en todo esto. Tu abrigo viejo, al parecer es verde. El mío nuevo, es oscuro, aunque te haya dicho que es verde. (Moncada: Caprichos: 36, Id 26, 1992, cité par CREA in Lindschouw, 243.

(‘V. (unfolding the coat): There’s something confusing about all this. Your old coat seems to be green. Mine, new, is dark, though I told you it’s green.’)

### 2.) Subjunctive and comparatives scales

(11) Sit fur, sit sacrilegus ... At est bonus imperator . . .

(‘He might be a thief, a sacrilegious thief. Yet he is a great commander’)

(Cic. Ver. 5.4 in Pinkster 2015: 509)

### 3.) Comparative scales and subjunctive in other contexts (e.g. Italian comparative clauses)

(12) ‘É un talento ancora più precoce di quanto lo sia stato io’

(‘He is a talent even more precocious than I was’)

(Corriere della Sera, 17.02.97, 45)

# Diachronic evolution of concessive clauses in French and Spanish

## 6.) A concise conclusion

- Free-choice constructions and constructions based on focus particles with concessive-conditional meaning serve as crucial source constructions for the development of concessive clauses;
- > These constructions are associated with the core domain of the subjunctive mood: reference to possible alternatives/worlds – either a maximally broad range of conceivable alternatives or a particularly salient subset thereof;
- Dynamics of Evolution:
  - In Spanish, the subjunctive in concessive clauses is expanding to include presuppositional contexts (not yet generalized);
  - In French, the subjunctive has almost entirely generalized in concessive contexts (exception: adversative reading of „encore que“ akin to „mais“ in post-position)
- The semantics of concessive clauses unfolds in a borderline region between the subjunctive and the indicative;
- > Crucial role of mood marking for scalar gradation: states of affairs p and q are compared and ranked with respect to their degree of relevance and effectiveness;
- > Comparable configurations: comparative clauses in Italian (p più che q);

**THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION !!!**